

LETTERS

Edited by Jennifer Sills

Investigate the origins of COVID-19

On 30 December 2019, the Program for Monitoring Emerging Diseases notified the world about a pneumonia of unknown cause in Wuhan, China (1). Since then, scientists have made remarkable progress in understanding the causative agent, severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2), its transmission, pathogenesis, and mitigation by vaccines, therapeutics, and non-pharmaceutical interventions. Yet more investigation is still needed to determine the origin of the pandemic. Theories of accidental release from a lab and zoonotic spillover both remain viable. Knowing how COVID-19 emerged is critical for informing global strategies to mitigate the risk of future outbreaks.

In May 2020, the World Health Assembly requested that the World Health Organization (WHO) director-general work closely with partners to determine the origins of SARS-CoV-2 (2). In November, the Terms of Reference for a China–WHO joint study were released (3). The information, data, and samples for the study's first phase were collected and summarized by the Chinese half of the team; the rest of the team built on this analysis. Although there were no findings in clear support of either a natural spillover or a lab accident, the team assessed a zoonotic spillover from an intermediate host as “likely to very likely,” and a laboratory incident as “extremely unlikely” [(4), p. 9]. Furthermore, the two theories were not given balanced consideration. Only 4 of the 313 pages of the report and its annexes addressed the possibility of a laboratory accident (4). Notably, WHO Director-General Tedros Ghebreyesus commented that the report's consideration of evidence supporting a laboratory accident was insufficient and offered to provide additional resources to fully evaluate the possibility (5).

As scientists with relevant expertise, we agree with the WHO director-general (5), the United States and 13 other countries (6), and the European Union (7) that greater clarity about the origins of this pandemic is necessary and feasible to achieve. We must take hypotheses about both natural and laboratory spillovers seriously until we have sufficient data. A proper investigation should be transparent, objective, data-driven,

inclusive of broad expertise, subject to independent oversight, and responsibly managed to minimize the impact of conflicts of interest. Public health agencies and research laboratories alike need to open their records to the public. Investigators should document the veracity and provenance of data from which analyses are conducted and conclusions drawn, so that analyses are reproducible by independent experts.

Finally, in this time of unfortunate anti-Asian sentiment in some countries, we note that at the beginning of the pandemic, it was Chinese doctors, scientists, journalists, and citizens who shared with the world crucial information about the spread of the virus—often at great personal cost (8, 9). We should show the same determination in promoting a dispassionate science-based discourse on this difficult but important issue.

Jesse D. Bloom^{1,2}, Yujia Alina Chan³, Ralph S. Baric⁴, Pamela J. Bjorkman⁵, Sarah Cobey⁶, Benjamin E. Deverman³, David N. Fisman⁷, Ravindra Gupta⁸, Akiko Iwasaki^{9,2}, Marc Lipsitch¹⁰, Ruslan Medzhitov^{9,2}, Richard A. Neher¹¹, Rasmus Nielsen¹², Nick Patterson¹³, Tim Stearns¹⁴, Erik van Nimwegen¹⁵, Michael Worobey¹⁵, David A. Relman^{16,17*}

¹Basic Sciences and Computational Biology, Fred Hutchinson Cancer Research Center, Seattle, WA 98109, USA. ²Howard Hughes Medical Institute, Chevy Chase, MD 20815, USA. ³Stanley Center for Psychiatric Research, Broad Institute of Massachusetts Institute of Technology and Harvard University, Cambridge, MA 02142, USA. ⁴Department of Epidemiology and Department of Microbiology & Immunology, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, Chapel Hill, NC 27599, USA. ⁵Division of Biology and Biological Engineering, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, CA 91125, USA. ⁶Department of Ecology and Evolution, University of Chicago, Chicago, IL 60637, USA. ⁷Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto, Toronto, ON M5S 1A8, Canada. ⁸Cambridge Institute of Therapeutic Immunology & Infectious Disease, Cambridge, UK. ⁹Department of Immunobiology, Yale University School of Medicine, New Haven, CT 06519, USA. ¹⁰Department of Immunology and Infectious Diseases and Center for Communicable Disease Dynamics, Department of Epidemiology, Harvard T. H. Chan School of Public Health, Boston, MA 02115, USA. ¹¹Biozentrum, University of Basel and Swiss Institute of Bioinformatics, Basel, Switzerland. ¹²Department of Integrative Biology and Department of Statistics, University of California, Berkeley, CA 94720, USA. ¹³Department of Human Evolutionary Biology, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA 02138, USA. ¹⁴Department of Biology and Department of Genetics, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305, USA. ¹⁵Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of Arizona, Tucson, AZ 85721, USA. ¹⁶Department of Medicine and Department of Microbiology & Immunology, Stanford University School of Medicine, Stanford, CA 94305, USA. ¹⁷Center for International Security and Cooperation, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305, USA. *Corresponding author. Email: relman@stanford.edu

REFERENCES AND NOTES

1. “Undiagnosed pneumonia—China (Hubei): Request for information,” ProMED post (2019); <https://promedmail.org/promed-post/?id=6864153>.
2. World Health Assembly Resolution 73.1: COVID-19 response (2020); https://apps.who.int/gb/ebwha/pdf_files/WHA73/A73_R1-en.pdf.
3. WHO, “WHO-convened global study of the origins of SARS-CoV-2” (2020); www.who.int/publications/m/item/who-convened-global-study-of-the-origins-of-sars-cov-2.



4. WHO, “WHO-convened global study of origins of SARS-CoV-2: China part” (2021); www.who.int/publications/item/who-convened-global-study-of-origins-of-sars-cov-2-china-part.
5. WHO, “WHO director-general’s remarks at the Member State Briefing on the report of the international team studying the origins of SARS-CoV-2” (2021); www.who.int/director-general/speeches/detail/who-director-general-s-remarks-at-the-member-state-briefing-on-the-report-of-the-international-team-studying-the-origins-of-sars-cov-2.
6. US Department of State, “Joint statement on the WHO-Convened COVID-19 origins study” (2021); www.state.gov/joint-statement-on-the-who-convened-covid-19-origins-study/.
7. Delegation of the European Union to the UN and other International Organizations in Geneva “EU statement on the WHO-led COVID-19 origins study” (2021); <https://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/un-geneva/95960/eu-statement-who-led-covid-19-origins-study-en>.
8. J. Hollingsworth, Y. Xiong, “The truth-tellers: China created a story of the pandemic. These people revealed details Beijing left out,” *CNN* (2021).
9. A. Green, L. Wenliang, *Lancet* **395**, 682 (2020).

10.1126/science.abj0016

Ban veterinary use of diclofenac in Europe

In Europe, vulture recovery has been an important conservation success story (1). This success may now be jeopardized by the use of diclofenac in Europe’s pastoral landscapes. Although diclofenac had already caused a rapid and catastrophic 95% decline in Asian vulture populations (2), the non-steroidal anti-inflammatory drug was approved for veterinary use in Spain in 2013 (3). Although measures for the safe disposal of carcasses of livestock treated with diclofenac are supposed to prevent avian scavengers from feeding on contaminated carrion (4), a Spanish cinereous vulture (*Aegypius monachus*) was found dead,

PHOTO: MARIO SUAREZ FORRAS/MINDEN PICTURES

Investigate the origins of COVID-19

Jesse D. Bloom, Yujia Alina Chan, Ralph S. Baric, Pamela J. Bjorkman, Sarah Cobey, Benjamin E. Deverman, David N. Fisman, Ravindra Gupta, Akiko Iwasaki, Marc Lipsitch, Ruslan Medzhitov, Richard A. Neher, Rasmus Nielsen, Nick Patterson, Tim Stearns, Erik van Nimwegen, Michael Worobey and David A. Relman

Science **372** (6543), 694.
DOI: 10.1126/science.abj0016

ARTICLE TOOLS <http://science.sciencemag.org/content/372/6543/694.1>

REFERENCES This article cites 1 articles, 0 of which you can access for free
<http://science.sciencemag.org/content/372/6543/694.1#BIBL>

PERMISSIONS <http://www.sciencemag.org/help/reprints-and-permissions>

Use of this article is subject to the [Terms of Service](#)

Science (print ISSN 0036-8075; online ISSN 1095-9203) is published by the American Association for the Advancement of Science, 1200 New York Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20005. The title *Science* is a registered trademark of AAAS.

Copyright © 2021 The Authors, some rights reserved; exclusive licensee American Association for the Advancement of Science. No claim to original U.S. Government Works